## Appendix B

## Verification of plastic solutions

We compare the approximate solutions from SNAC with the analytic solutions to two simple problems including plasticity: an oedometer test and a problem of a thick cylinder with a pressurized inner wall. Readers are referred to standard textbooks on plasticity for more details of these problems (e.g., Hill, 1998; Davis and Selvadurai, 2002).

## B. 1 Oedometer test

This simple problem tests if SNAC can properly handle the angular geometry of the Mohr-Coulomb yield surface.

## B.1.1 Problem Setup

A cube of Mohr-Coulomb material is pressed on one surface while all the other surfaces are confined such that they have free-slip boundary conditions (Fig.B.1).

Special care is needed for the angular yield envelope of the Mohr-Coulomb model. This oedometer test provides a direct test in this regard because the post-yielding stress state resides on one of the edges of the Mohr-Coulomb yield surface.


Figure B.1: Schematic diagram depicting the oedometer test.

## B.1.2 Analytic Solutions

## B.1.2.1 Elastic solution

$$
\begin{align*}
\Delta \epsilon_{x} & =\frac{v \Delta t}{L-v t}  \tag{B.1}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{y} & =\Delta \varepsilon_{z}=0 \tag{B.2}
\end{align*}
$$

$$
\begin{align*}
\Delta \sigma_{x} & =(\lambda+2 \mu) \Delta \epsilon_{x}  \tag{B.3}\\
\Delta \sigma_{y} & =\lambda \Delta \epsilon_{x}  \tag{B.4}\\
\Delta \sigma_{z} & =\sigma_{y} . \tag{B.5}
\end{align*}
$$

## B.1.2.2 Plastic solution

Yield criteria for Mohr-Coulomb plasticity are defined as

$$
\begin{align*}
& F^{1}=\sigma_{x}-\sigma_{y} N_{\phi}+2 c \sqrt{N_{\phi}}  \tag{B.6}\\
& F^{2}=\sigma_{x}-\sigma_{z} N_{\phi}+2 c \sqrt{N_{\phi}} . \tag{B.7}
\end{align*}
$$

During plastic flow, the strain increments are composed of elastic and plastic parts and we have

$$
\begin{align*}
\Delta \epsilon_{x} & =\Delta \epsilon_{x}^{e}+\Delta \epsilon_{x}^{p}  \tag{B.8}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{y} & =\Delta \epsilon_{y}^{e}+\Delta \epsilon_{y}^{p}  \tag{B.9}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{z} & =\Delta \epsilon_{z}^{e}+\Delta \epsilon_{z}^{p} \tag{B.10}
\end{align*}
$$

Using the boundary conditions, we may write

$$
\begin{align*}
\Delta \epsilon_{x}^{e} & =\frac{v \Delta t}{L-v t}-\Delta \epsilon_{x}^{p}  \tag{B.11}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{y}^{e} & =-\Delta \epsilon_{y}^{p}  \tag{B.12}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{z}^{e} & =-\Delta \epsilon_{z}^{p} . \tag{B.13}
\end{align*}
$$

The flow rule for plastic flow along the edge of the Mohr-Coulomb criterion corresponding to $\sigma_{y}=\sigma_{z}$ has the form

$$
\begin{align*}
\Delta \epsilon_{x}^{p} & =\lambda_{1} \frac{\partial G^{1}}{\partial \sigma_{x}}+\lambda_{2} \frac{\partial G^{2}}{\partial \sigma_{x}}  \tag{B.14}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{y}^{p} & =\lambda_{1} \frac{\partial G^{1}}{\partial \sigma_{y}}+\lambda_{2} \frac{\partial G^{2}}{\partial \sigma_{y}}  \tag{B.15}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{z}^{p} & =\lambda_{1} \frac{\partial G^{1}}{\partial \sigma_{z}}+\lambda_{2} \frac{\partial G^{2}}{\partial \sigma_{z}} \tag{B.16}
\end{align*}
$$

where $G^{1}$ and $G^{2}$ are the potential functions corresponding to $F^{1}$ and $F^{2}$ :

$$
\begin{align*}
G^{1} & =\sigma_{x}-\sigma_{y} N_{\psi}  \tag{B.17}\\
G^{2} & =\sigma_{x}-\sigma_{z} N_{\psi} \tag{B.18}
\end{align*}
$$

After substitution,

$$
\begin{align*}
\Delta \epsilon_{x}^{p} & =\lambda_{1}+\lambda_{2}  \tag{B.19}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{y}^{p} & =-\lambda_{1} N_{\psi}  \tag{B.20}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{z}^{p} & =-\lambda_{2} N_{\psi} . \tag{B.21}
\end{align*}
$$

By symmetry, we know $\lambda_{1}=\lambda_{2}$ :

$$
\begin{align*}
\Delta \epsilon_{x}^{p} & =2 \lambda_{1}  \tag{B.22}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{y}^{p} & =-\lambda_{1} N_{\psi}  \tag{B.23}\\
\Delta \epsilon_{z}^{p} & =-\lambda_{1} N_{\psi} . \tag{B.24}
\end{align*}
$$

The stress increments are given as

$$
\begin{align*}
\Delta \sigma_{x} & =(\lambda+2 \mu) \Delta \epsilon_{x}^{e}+2 \lambda \Delta \epsilon_{y}^{e}  \tag{B.25}\\
\Delta \sigma_{y} & =(\lambda+2 \mu) \Delta \epsilon_{y}^{e}+\lambda\left(\Delta \epsilon_{x}^{e}+\Delta \epsilon_{y}^{e}\right)  \tag{B.26}\\
\Delta \sigma_{z} & =\Delta \sigma_{y} \tag{B.27}
\end{align*}
$$

$$
\begin{align*}
\Delta \sigma_{x} & =(\lambda+2 \mu)\left(\frac{v \Delta t}{L-v t}-2 \lambda_{1}\right)+2 \lambda \lambda_{1} N_{\psi}  \tag{B.28}\\
\Delta \sigma_{y} & =(\lambda+2 \mu) \lambda_{1} N_{\psi}+\lambda\left(\frac{v \Delta t}{L-v t}-2 \lambda_{1}+\lambda_{1} N_{\psi}\right)  \tag{B.29}\\
\Delta \sigma_{z} & =\Delta \sigma_{y} \tag{B.30}
\end{align*}
$$

During plastic flow, the consistency condition that $\Delta F^{1}=0$ should be satisfied, which takes the form

$$
\begin{equation*}
\Delta \sigma_{x}-\Delta \sigma_{y} N_{\phi}=0 \tag{B.31}
\end{equation*}
$$

Solving for $\lambda_{1}$, we get

$$
\begin{equation*}
\lambda_{1}=\frac{\left(\lambda+2 \mu-\lambda N_{\phi}\right) \frac{v \Delta t}{L-v t}}{2(\lambda+2 \mu)-2 \lambda\left(N_{\phi}+N_{\psi}\right)+2(\lambda+\mu) N_{\phi} N_{\psi}} . \tag{B.32}
\end{equation*}
$$

## B.1.3 Results

The following parameters are used:

- Bulk modulus: 200 MPa .
- Shear modulus: 200 MPa .
- Cohesion: 1 MPa .
- Friction angle: $10^{\circ}$.
- Dilation angle: $10^{\circ}$.
- Tension cut-off: 5.67 MPa.
- Boundary Conditions: $v_{x}=-1.0 \times 10^{-5} \mathrm{~m} / \mathrm{sec}$.
- $\Delta t=1 \mathrm{sec}$.
- Mesh size: $1 \times 1 \times 1 \mathrm{~m}$, and $5 \times 5 \times 5$ nodes.

The stress $\left(\sigma_{x x}\right)$ is plotted against the strain $\left(\epsilon_{x x}\right)$ in Fig.B. 2 for the solution of SNAC and the analytic solution. Those two solutions show a good agreement.

## B. 2 Thick cylinder with a pressurized inner wall

## B.2.1 Problem Setup

We compute the equilibrium solution for a thick cylinder with a pressure applied on its inner and outer wall. The cylinder is assumed to be long along its axis such that the problem becomes a plane-strain one.

The problem is constructed by the following mathematical statements:

- Momentum balance:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\frac{d \sigma_{r r}}{d r}+\frac{\sigma_{r r}-\sigma_{\theta \theta}}{r}=0 . \tag{B.33}
\end{equation*}
$$



Figure B.2: Plots of stress vs. strain for analytic solutions and those from SNAC.

- Boundary conditions:

$$
\begin{gather*}
\sigma_{r r}(a)=-P_{i},  \tag{B.34}\\
\sigma_{r r}(b)=-P_{o} . \tag{B.35}
\end{gather*}
$$

Note: The sign is negative because compressional.

- Plane strain:

$$
\begin{gather*}
\epsilon_{z z}=0  \tag{B.36}\\
\sigma_{z z}=\nu\left(\sigma_{r r}+\sigma_{\theta \theta}\right) \tag{B.37}
\end{gather*}
$$

- Constitutive Relations:

$$
\begin{gather*}
\epsilon_{r r}=\frac{d u_{r}}{d r}  \tag{B.38}\\
\epsilon_{\theta \theta}=\frac{u_{r}}{r}  \tag{B.39}\\
\sigma_{r r}=\lambda e+2 G \epsilon_{r r}, \tag{B.40}
\end{gather*}
$$



Figure B.3: Schematic diagram for the problem of the thick cylinder with a pressurized inner wall

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sigma_{\theta \theta}=\lambda e+2 G \epsilon_{\theta \theta}, \tag{B.41}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $e$ is the volumetric strain.

- Yield and flow functions:

Since $\sigma_{\theta \theta}(>0)>\sigma_{z z}>\sigma_{r r}(<0)$,

$$
\begin{gather*}
f=\sigma_{\theta \theta}-N \sigma_{r r}-2 c \sqrt{N} \leq 0, \quad N=\frac{1+\sin \phi}{1-\sin \phi}  \tag{B.42}\\
g=\sigma_{\theta \theta}-M \sigma_{r r}, \quad M=\frac{1+\sin \psi}{1-\sin \psi} \tag{B.43}
\end{gather*}
$$

## B.2.2 Analytic Solutions

By combining (B.33) and (B.38)-(B.41), we get the momentum balance equation in terms of the non-trivial radial component of displacement, $u_{r}$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
\frac{d^{2} u_{r}}{d r^{2}}+\frac{1}{r} \frac{d u_{r}}{d r}-\frac{u_{r}}{r^{2}}=0 \tag{B.44}
\end{equation*}
$$

A general solution has the form

$$
\begin{equation*}
u_{r}=C_{1} r+\frac{C_{2}}{r} \tag{B.45}
\end{equation*}
$$

Then, strain components become

$$
\begin{align*}
& \epsilon_{r r}=C_{1}-\frac{C_{2}}{r^{2}}  \tag{B.46}\\
& \epsilon_{\theta \theta}=C_{1}+\frac{C_{2}}{r^{2}} \tag{B.47}
\end{align*}
$$

## B.2.2.1 Elastic solution

$$
\begin{align*}
\sigma_{r r}(a) & =-P_{i}=\lambda\left(2 C_{1}\right)+2 G\left(C_{1}-\frac{C_{2}}{a^{2}}\right)  \tag{B.48}\\
& =2(\lambda+G) C_{1}-\frac{2 G}{a^{2}} C_{2}, \\
\sigma_{r r}(b) & =-P_{o}=\lambda\left(2 C_{1}\right)+2 G\left(C_{1}-\frac{C_{2}}{b^{2}}\right)  \tag{B.49}\\
& =2(\lambda+G) C_{1}-\frac{2 G}{b^{2}} C_{2} .
\end{align*}
$$

From (B.48) and (B.49),

$$
\begin{align*}
C_{1} & =\frac{a^{2} P_{i}-b^{2} P_{o}}{2(\lambda+G)\left(b^{2}-a^{2}\right)},  \tag{B.50}\\
C_{2} & =\frac{P_{i}-P_{o}}{2 G} \frac{a^{2} b^{2}}{b^{2}-a^{2}} . \tag{B.51}
\end{align*}
$$

The full solution for the radial component of displacements is

$$
\begin{equation*}
u_{r}=\frac{a^{2} P_{i}-b^{2} P_{o}}{2(\lambda+G)\left(b^{2}-a^{2}\right)} r+\frac{P_{i}-P_{o}}{2 G} \frac{a^{2} b^{2}}{b^{2}-a^{2}} \frac{1}{r} . \tag{B.52}
\end{equation*}
$$

Components of strains are given as

$$
\begin{equation*}
\epsilon_{r r}=\frac{a^{2} P_{i}-b^{2} P_{o}}{2(\lambda+G)\left(b^{2}-a^{2}\right)}-\frac{P_{i}-P_{o}}{2 G} \frac{a^{2} b^{2}}{b^{2}-a^{2}} \frac{1}{r^{2}}, \tag{B.53}
\end{equation*}
$$

$$
\begin{equation*}
\epsilon_{\theta \theta}=\frac{a^{2} P_{i}-b^{2} P_{o}}{2(\lambda+G)\left(b^{2}-a^{2}\right)}+\frac{P_{i}-P_{o}}{2 G} \frac{a^{2} b^{2}}{b^{2}-a^{2}} \frac{1}{r^{2}} . \tag{B.54}
\end{equation*}
$$

Finally, stress components are

$$
\begin{align*}
& \sigma_{r r}=\frac{a^{2} P_{i}-b^{2} P_{o}}{b^{2}-a^{2}}-\frac{\left(P_{i}-P_{o}\right) a^{2} b^{2}}{b^{2}-a^{2}} \frac{1}{r^{2}},  \tag{B.55}\\
& \sigma_{\theta \theta}=\frac{a^{2} P_{i}-b^{2} P_{o}}{b^{2}-a^{2}}+\frac{\left(P_{i}-P_{o}\right) a^{2} b^{2}}{b^{2}-a^{2}} \frac{1}{r^{2}} . \tag{B.56}
\end{align*}
$$

## B.2.2.2 Plastic solution

In the elastic region : Let us assume that region of $r \leq d$ yielded, where $d$ is the outer radius of the yielded region and $a<d<b$. Also, let $\sigma_{d}$ be the stress at $r=d$. Then, solution for the elastic region $(r>d)$ are acquired by simply substituting $d$ and $\sigma_{d}-P_{o}$ for $a$ and $P_{i}-P_{o}$ in (B.52), (B.53), (B.54), (B.55), and (B.56). Specifically, stress components are given as:

$$
\begin{align*}
& \sigma_{r r}=\frac{d^{2} \sigma_{d}-b^{2} P_{o}}{b^{2}-d^{2}}-\frac{\left(\sigma_{d}-P_{o}\right) d^{2} b^{2}}{b^{2}-d^{2}} \frac{1}{r^{2}},  \tag{B.57}\\
& \sigma_{\theta \theta}=\frac{d^{2} \sigma_{d}-b^{2} P_{o}}{b^{2}-d^{2}}+\frac{\left(\sigma_{d}-P_{o}\right) d^{2} b^{2}}{b^{2}-d^{2}} \frac{1}{r^{2}} . \tag{B.58}
\end{align*}
$$

In the plastic region : The yield function (B.42) should be 0 in the plastic region. So, we insert

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sigma_{\theta \theta}=N \sigma_{r r}+2 c \sqrt{N} \tag{B.59}
\end{equation*}
$$

into (B.33):

$$
\frac{d \sigma_{r r}}{d r}+\frac{\sigma_{r r}}{r}-\frac{N \sigma_{r r}+2 c \sqrt{N}}{r}=0
$$

. Then, we get an ordinary differential equation for $\sigma_{r r}$

$$
\begin{equation*}
\frac{d \sigma_{r r}}{d r}+(1-N) \frac{\sigma_{r r}}{r}-\frac{2 c \sqrt{N}}{r}=0 \tag{B.60}
\end{equation*}
$$

The solution to the ODE

$$
y^{\prime}=a \frac{y}{x}+\frac{b}{x}
$$

is

$$
y=-\frac{b}{a}+C_{1} x^{a}
$$

where $C_{1}$ needs to be determined using a boundary condition. The corresponding coefficients in (B.60) are

$$
a=-(1-N), \quad b=2 c \sqrt{N} .
$$

The solution for $\sigma_{r r}$ is

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sigma_{r r}=-\frac{2 c \sqrt{N}}{N-1}+C_{1} r^{N-1} \tag{B.61}
\end{equation*}
$$

The value of $C_{1}$ is determined by the stress continuity at $r=d$, i.e., $\sigma_{r r}(d)=-\sigma_{d}$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
C_{1}=\left(-\sigma_{d}+\frac{2 c \sqrt{N}}{N-1}\right) d^{1-N} \tag{B.62}
\end{equation*}
$$

The complete stress solution in the plastic regions is

$$
\begin{align*}
\sigma_{r r}(r) & =-\frac{2 c \sqrt{N}}{N-1}+\left(-\sigma_{d}+\frac{2 c \sqrt{N}}{N-1}\right)\left(\frac{r}{d}\right)^{N-1}  \tag{B.63}\\
\sigma_{\theta \theta}(r) & =N \sigma_{r r}+2 c \sqrt{N} \\
& =-\frac{2 c \sqrt{N}}{N-1}+N\left(-\sigma_{d}+\frac{2 c \sqrt{N}}{N-1}\right)\left(\frac{r}{d}\right)^{N-1} . \tag{B.64}
\end{align*}
$$

In the above formulae, $\sigma_{d}$ is still unknown. The elastic stress solutions (B. 57 and B.58) should make the yield function (B.42) zero when yieldeing occurs initially at

$$
r=a .
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{a^{2} P_{i}-b^{2} P_{o}}{b^{2}-a^{2}}+\frac{\left(P_{i}-P_{o}\right) a^{2}}{b^{2}-d^{2}} \frac{b^{2}}{a^{2}} \\
& -N\left[\frac{a^{2} P_{i}-b^{2} P_{o}}{b^{2}-a^{2}}-\frac{\left(P_{i}-P_{o}\right) a^{2}}{b^{2}-a^{2}} \frac{b^{2}}{a^{2}}\right]-2 c \sqrt{N}=0 \\
& \frac{\left(a^{2}+b^{2}\right) P_{i}-2 b^{2} P_{o}}{b^{2}-a^{2}}+N P_{i}-2 c \sqrt{N}=0 \\
& \therefore P_{i 0}(a)=\frac{2 c \sqrt{N}+\left(2 b^{2} /\left(b^{2}-a^{2}\right)\right) P_{o}}{N+\left(b^{2}+a^{2}\right) /\left(b^{2}-a^{2}\right)}
\end{aligned}
$$

Since the same should hold for any end condition.

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sigma_{d}(d)=\frac{2 c \sqrt{N}+\left(2 b^{2} /\left(b^{2}-d^{2}\right)\right) P_{o}}{N+\left(b^{2}+d^{2}\right) /\left(b^{2}-d^{2}\right)} \tag{B.65}
\end{equation*}
$$

Finally, $d$ is numerically determined by finding $r$ at which the yield function becomes zero.

To benchmark SNAC's solution, we use (B.57), (B.58), (B.63), and (B.64) with numerically computed $d$.

## B.2.3 Results

We present the results for the following parameters:

- Bulk modulus: 200 MPa .
- Shear modulus: 200 MPa .
- Cohesion: 1 MPa .
- Friction angle: $10^{\circ}$.
- Dilation angle: $10^{\circ}$.
- Tension cut-off: 567 MPa .
- Grid size: $31 \times 3 \times 31$.


Figure B.4: The square root of the second invariant of stress from SNAC. Profiles shown in Fig.B. 5 are extracted along the radial direction (the black arrow)

- Geometry of cylinder: $a$ (inner radius) $=3.0 \mathrm{~m}, b$ (outer radius) $=10.0 \mathrm{~m}$.
- Boundary Conditions: $P_{i}=20.0 \mathrm{MPa}$, and $P_{o}=0.0 \mathrm{MPa}$. Two surfaces normal to the axis are free-slip.
- $d t=1$ sec and results are compared after SNAC proceeds 5000 steps.

The second invariant of stress $\left(I_{\sigma}\right)$ is chosen as a representative value and Fig.B. 4 shows the spatial distribution of the squre root of $I I_{\sigma}$.

The radial profile of $\sqrt{I I_{\sigma}}$ for the SNAC's solution is shown in Fig.B. 5 together with the analytic and purely analytic solutions. The SNAC's solution shows a good agreement with the analytic solution.


Figure B.5: Radial profiles of the square root of the second invariant of stressi $\left(I I_{\sigma}\right)$ : Circles for SNAC's solution, crosses for analytic solution, and a dashed line for the analytic solution for the purely elastic case.

## References

Davis, R. O., Selvadurai, A. P. S., 2002. Plasticity and Geomechanics. Cambridge University Press.

Hill, R., 1998. The Mathematical Theory of Plasticity. Oxford University Press, U.S.A.

